1.1 🥊 The Fight On The Oval

**Setting the scene**

Imagine that you are the principal of a school and you just found out that there was a fight on the oval during lunch. You’ve asked many students and teachers who witnessed the fight to write down what they saw and who they think started the fight. Unfortunately, you have received many conflicting accounts that disagree not only as to who started the fight, but also as to who was involved and when the fight even started. It’s important to remember that NO ONE is just plain lying.

**Questions - answer in pairs**

1. Why would there be different stories of the event if no one is just plain lying?

1. What are the different types of people who might have seen this fight? (e.g., friends of those involved; people who don’t know the kids who were fighting; those who were fighting; teachers; students)

1. What might make one person’s story more believable or plausible than another person’s?

**The Sources**

**Justin:** “That kid started it. Max. I was just standing eating my food, and he shoved me super hard. And, like, for no reason. He just freaked out on me. I don’t even know the kid, and he’s been weird to me ever since I started going to this school. He and his friends glare at me in English class for no reason.”

**Max:** “That kid is psycho. He turned around and punched me out of nowhere. Me and my friends were walking along and just joking around, and he turned around and punched me for no reason. He’s messed up and creepy. Ask anyone.”

**Eric (Max’s good friend):** “The new kid definitely started it. He really just attacked out of nowhere. He’s a freak, and he seriously thinks he’s better than everyone because of his dad.”

**Anthony (bystander):** “I was pretty far away, but Max and his friends were being kind of loud and joking around. I couldn’t really hear what they were saying. And then all of a sudden I saw people pulling Justin and Max apart."

**Megan (Max’s girlfriend):** “I wasn’t there. All I can say is that Max has been really different lately and kind of mean. I don’t know what’s going on, but he’s not himself.

**Music Teacher:** “The group of boys were pushing each other around. I think it was an accident, and one of them pushed into the new boy, and he took it the wrong way.”

**Max’s mother:** “Max would never start a fight. He’s the sweetest boy. I know he’s had a hard time lately with me and his dad losing our jobs, but he still would never start a fight with anyone. He’s a mentor to the younger boys and helps out at the meeting. You can ask anyone.”

**Justin’s father:** “I can guarantee 100% that Justin would never lay a finger on anyone unless he was really provoked. Trust me. And I know because we’ve had to move around quite a bit in the last few years because of my job, so unfortunately, Justin knows what it’s like to be the new kid. And I’ve watched him go through these adjustment periods at each new school. He just lies low, and pretty soon the other kids see what a great kid he is. So I know as a fact that Justin wouldn’t stir up trouble. It’s really not in his nature.”

**Jamie (student in English class with Max and Justin in the lesson right before lunch):** “I wasn’t on the oval today, and I’m not friends with any of those guys, but I’ve seen Max and his friends be mean to Justin in the hallways and in class when the teacher isn’t looking. Not physical or anything, but they’ll like say jokes under their breath and then laugh and stuff like that. They make him uncomfortable.”

**English teacher:** “To be completely honest with you, I’m not surprised that this happened. There has been a lot of tension in the school and in the town, in general, with the reorganization plan. A lot of people are very upset with the decisions of the new management to fire people, and I must say that I myself am very surprised that they’ve done this. It’s a tremendous strain on the community, and I feel for all the boys.

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Town Context: What is happening in the town that might explain the oval fight? | Who said this? | Explain if this source is reliable or not and why. |
| 1.    2.    3. | 1.    2.    3 | 1.    2.    3 |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| School Context: What has been happening in the rest of the school (for example, in English) | Who said this? | Explain if this source is reliable or not and why. |
| 1.    2.    3. | 1.    2.    3 | 1.    2.    3 |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Oval Context:  What happened on the oval? | Who said this? | Explain if this source is reliable or not and why. |
| 1.    2.    3. | 1.    2.    3 | 1.    2.    3 |

|  |
| --- |
| Graphical user interface  Description automatically generated with medium confidence |
| 1. What happened in the cafeteria? (Please identify sources of information.) |
| 2. In my judgment, the following student should be suspended:      My reasoning is as follows: |
| Graphical user interface, text, application  Description automatically generated |